

Appendix B: Highway Project Evaluation Criteria

I. Reduction of Congestion (Existing Facilities Only)

A. Evaluation Factor: Present Level of Service

Score: -10 points if Level of Service is equal to "A"
-5 points if Level of Service is equal to "B"
0 points if Level of Service is equal to "C"
+10 points if Level of Service is between "D" and "E"
+20 points if Level of Service is equal to "F"

B. Evaluation Factor: Future Level of Service (No Build)

Score: -10 points if Level of Service is equal to "A"
-5 points if Level of Service is equal to "B"
0 points if Level of Service is equal to "C"
+10 points if Level of Service is between "D" and "E"
+20 points if Level of Service is equal to "F"

C. Evaluation Factor: Change in Future Level of Service (Build vs. No Build)

Score: 0 points if no change in Level of Service
+10 points if Level of Service decreases by one letter
+20 points if Level of Service decreases by more than one letter

Maximum Points for Category: 60 (24% of total)

II. Projected Traffic Volumes / Time Savings (New Highways on New Alignments Only)

A. Evaluation Factor: 25 year Level of Service

Score: 0 points if future* Level of Service is "B" or less
+30 points if future* Level of Service is "E" or greater
+45 points if future* Level of Service is equal to "D"
+60 points if future* Level of Service is equal to "C"

B. Evaluation Factor: Difference in forecast year travel time from one end of the project to the other vs. using existing highway network

- Score: -5 points if forecast year travel time is greater than with the existing network
0 points if forecast year travel time reduction is less than 10 minutes
+10 points if forecast year travel time reduction is between 10 and 20 minutes
+15 points if forecast year travel time reduction is 20 minutes or greater

Maximum Points for Category: 75 (23% of total)

**III. Existing Structural Condition
(Existing Facilities Only)**

Evaluation Factor: Construction date or years since last reconstruction

Score: 0 points if all highway segments or all bridges age is less than 45 years by the forecast year

+ 10 points if one of the following conditions exist:

At least one highway segment was constructed or reconstructed 46 to 60 years prior to the forecast year

At least one bridge has a sufficiency score between 50.1 and 75.0

+ 15 points if one of the following conditions exist:

At least one highway segment was constructed or reconstructed greater than 60 years prior to the forecast year

At least one bridge has a sufficiency score of 50.0 or less

Maximum Points for Category: 15 (4.6% of total)

IV. Future Impact on Adjacent Roads

A: Future Impact on Adjacent Roads

Evaluation Factor: Positive Level of Service Impacts

Score: 0 points if Level of Service remains the same for all roads within one mile of the proposed project
+10 points if Level of Service decreases by one or more letters for one road within one mile of the proposed project
+15 points if Level of Service decreases by one or more letters for two or more roads within one mile of the proposed project

Evaluation Factor: Negative Level of Service Impacts

Score: -5 points if Level of Service increases by one or more letters for one road within one mile of the proposed project
-10 points if Level of Service increases by one or more letters for two or more roads within one mile of the proposed project

An Additional 5 points will be subtracted if any of the above negative impacts occur on a road classified as a collector

*NOTE: Impacts will be evaluated only for functionally classified roads within one mile of the proposed project.

Maximum Points for Category: 15 (4.6% of total)

V. Benefits to Metropolitan Area

A. Evaluation Factor: Regional Connectivity

Score: 0 points if project is entirely within one incorporated city or entirely within unincorporated portions of McLennan County
+5 points if project connects two or more incorporated cities
+10 points if project completes a 4 lane divided or greater facility connecting the Waco Urbanized Area to another city with a population greater than 50,000

B. Evaluation Factor: Metropolitan Transportation Plan (MTP) Priority

Score: 0 points if project is not currently included in the MTP
+5 points if project is currently included in the MTP

C. Evaluation Factor: EIS underway or Complete

Score: +25 points if work producing an Environmental Impact Statement is either underway or complete.

D. Evaluation Factor: Multi-modal Benefits

Score: +5 points if one or more of the following are provided:

Upgrading Railroad Crossing (Includes installation of signals or 4-quad gates, channelization, or grade separation)

Road, Intersection, or Bridge provides or improves primary access to an intermodal facility (airports, bus terminals, motor freight terminal, railroad passenger terminals, or railroad freight facilities)

Road, Intersection, or Bridge provides or improves primary access to an existing or committed employer, industrial park or shopping center with greater than 1,000 employees

0 points if none of the above situations are applicable

E. Evaluation Factor: Bicycle and Pedestrian Considerations

Score: -5 points if project includes no provision for bicycles or pedestrians and a portion of the project is less than ½ mile from a public or private elementary or secondary school.

0 points if project includes no provision for bicycles or pedestrians

+5 points if provisions are made for bicycles or pedestrians. Work may include bike paths / lanes, sidewalks, pedestrian overpasses, wheelchair ramps (with connecting sidewalks) or signalized crosswalks.

+10 points if crosswalk or wheelchair ramp construction is combined with the construction of a raised median or intersection lane width reduction.

F. Evaluation Factor: Landscaping Provisions

Score: 0 points if no provisions for landscaping are made

+5 points if at least 1% of the project construction cost is devoted to landscaping

Maximum Points for Category: 60 (18.5% of total)

VI. Cost Factors

A. Evaluation Factor: Local Commitment

Score: 0 points if the minimum local share of the project cost is allocated by local sponsor(s)

+1 point for each percent of the project cost above the minimum necessary allocated by the local sponsor(s) (Maximum of 20 points)

+15 points additional if either pass through financing or the state infrastructure bank used to finance at least 50% of total project cost.

B. Evaluation Factor: Total Project Cost

Score: +20 points if 100% of the total project cost is funded through a federal earmark, public / private partnership, tolls, or other state financing program or local funds

If project funding is not provided through above mechanism then the following applies:

-20 points if the total project cost is greater than 30% of total federal construction funds available within TxDOT Categories 3 & 11

-10 points if the total project cost is between 20% and 29.9% of total federal construction funds available within TxDOT Categories 3 & 11

0 points if the total project cost of project is between 15% and 19.9% of total federal construction funds available within TxDOT Categories 3 & 11

+ 1 point for each 0.5% below 15% of total funds available within TxDOT Categories 3 & 11 (Maximum of 20 points)

Note: for projects where only a portion of the total cost is funded outside of Categories 3 & 11, that portion is subtracted from the total project cost and then reevaluated using the new cost.

Maximum Points for Category: 40 (12.3% of total)

VII. Classification System

A. Evaluation Factor: Functional Classification of Road

Score: 0 points for a collector or local road
+10 points for a minor arterial
+30 points for a principal arterial, freeway, expressway
or tollway

B. Evaluation Factor: State System or Non-State System

Score: -10 points for non-state system facilities
+5 points for state system facilities

Maximum Points for Category: 35 (10.8% of total)

VIII. Safety

A. Highway Segments

(Does not apply to intersections or new highways on new alignments)

Evaluation Factor: Crashes per million vehicle miles traveled

Score: 0 points if crash rate is below the following rates
+15 points if crash rate exceeds the following rates

Expressways: 0.7
Principal Arterials: 2.2
Minor Arterials: 3.1
Urban Collectors: 4.5
Rural Collectors: 1.0

B. Intersections

(Does not apply to highway segments or new highways on new alignments)

Evaluation Factor: Crashes per million vehicles entering intersection

Score: 0 points if crash rate is below 0.9 crashes per million vehicles
+15 points if crash rate exceeds 0.9 crashes per million
vehicles

C. High Crash Locations
(Does not apply to new highways on new alignments)

Evaluation Factor: Total Crashes on highway segment or in intersection

Score: 0 points if total crashes are less than 50 within a year
+10 points if total crashes exceed 50 within a year

D. New Highways on New Alignments

All new highways on new alignments will automatically receive +25 points from parts A & B as a result that they will be built to existing safety standards.

E. Project Effectiveness*

Evaluation Factor: Estimated Crash Reduction Factors**

Score: 0 points if estimated crash reduction less than 10
+5 points if estimated crash reduction is 10 or greater but less than 20
+10 points if estimated crash reduction 20 or greater but less than 40
+25 points if estimated crash reduction is 40 or greater

*New Highways on New Alignments will be evaluated based upon the estimated impact they might have on the facilities they will relieve.

**Reduction if improvements were made in 2001

F. Fatal or Serious Injury Crashes*

Evaluation Factor: Total crashes involving a fatality or serious injury

Score: +5 points for every crash involving a fatality
+1 point for every crash involving either an incapacitating injury or non-incapacitating injury

Maximum Points for Category: 85 (26.2% of total)

Maximum Total Points: 325